

Full chapter: <https://togetherforthecommongood.co.uk/leading-thinkers/the-spirit-and-the-common-good>

CHAPTER 3: RECOVERING OF EUCHARISTIC BEING IN A MARKET-SHAPED WORLD

FOOTNOTES

1. Rebecca Todd Peters, "Examining the Economic Crisis as a Crisis of Values," *Interpretation* (April 2011):154-66 (154).
2. In their 2012 book *Declaration*, Michael Hardt and Antonio Negri argue that "neoliberalism and its crisis have shifted the terms of economic and political life, but they have also operated a social, anthropological transformation, fabricating new figures of subjectivity." For example, the hegemony of finance and the banks has produced *the indebted'* (9). As the authors state, being in debt "is becoming the general condition of social life" today (10). In a way, "*debtfare*" has become the substitute to *welfare*. Hardt and Negri assert that exploitation's primary manifestation today is not unequal exchange but debt, transforming the creditor-indebted relationship into a new master-slave mode of existence in which the poverty of the enslaved "is characterized primarily by the chains of debt" (13) (*Declaration* [Argo Navis Author Services, 2012]).
3. M. Douglas Meeks, *God the Economist: The Doctrine of God and Political Economy* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1989), 38.
4. Meeks, *God the Economist*, 38.
5. Adam Smith, *The Theory of Moral Sentiments* (New York: Augustus M. Kelley, 19(41), 304. In this particular work, Smith advocates a connection between human greed and divine providence in God's "care of the universal happiness of all rational and sensible beings" (210) For further reading on Smith's ideas about the function of self-interest, see his work *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations* (London: William Benton, 1955). While superficial reading of his work in economics may give an impression of a secular rationale in support of his analyses and corresponding conclusions, many researchers have suggested 111;11 we view Smith as a "life-long moral philosopher, who never casts aside his earlier coney risk about human morality in his later pursuit of economic truths" (Kathryn D. Blanchard, *Protestant Ethic or the Spirit of Capitalism: Christians, Freedom, and Free Markets* [Eugene, OR, Cascade, 2010] , 57). Such an understanding of Smith necessitates keeping in dialectical to 11 his two main works, namely, *The Theory of Moral Sentiments* and *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations*, and it assumes that the second text is somehow informed and shaped by the first. If this is true, "then Smith can be seen as promoting an economic model that is based on socially sanctioned ethical norms supported by appropriate and just sot lid institutions" (Blanchard, *Protestant Ethic or the Spirit of Capitalism*, 57). Some authors go as far as to suggest that Smith is in fact a moral theologian and that his elaboration on the "invisible hand" is "his particular contribution to eighteenth-century theodicy" (Lisa Hill, "The Hidden Theology of Adam Smith," *European Journal of the History of Economic Thought* 8, no. 112001) 1-29 [22]). Hill articulates the various interpretations of the function of "the

invisible hand" in Smith's work, e.g., lexical and metaphorical, critical and ironic, evolutionary Darwinian, theological assertion of divine providence, and others.

6. Munyaradzi Felix Murove, "Perceptions of Greed in Western Economic and Religious Traditions: An African Communitarian Response," *Black Theology* 5, no. 2 (2007): 220-43.
7. Peters, "Examining the Economic Crisis as a Crisis of Values," 160.
8. William E. Connolly, "Capitalism, Christianity, America: Rethinking the Issues," *Political Theology* 12, no. 2 (2011): 226-36 (228)_
9. Connolly, "Capitalism, Christianity, America," 229.
10. Robert W. McChesney, introduction to *Profit over People: Neoliberalism and Global Order*, by Noam Chomsky (New York: Seven Stories, 1999), 7-16 (9).
11. McChesney, introduction, 10.
12. McChesney, introduction, 11.
13. Peters, "Examining the Economic Crisis as a Crisis of Values," 156 -58.
14. In his work, M. D. Meeks develops the concept of "surplus people" who do not fit in the logic and cycles of the market economy. See "The Church and the Poor in Supply Economics," *Cities* (Fall 1983): 6-9.
15. Bartholomew I, Archbishop of Constantinople and Ecumenical Patriarch, *Encountering the Mystery* (New York: Doubleday, 2008), 161.
16. Meeks, *God the Economist*, 33.
17. Meeks, *God the Economist*, 36.
18. For statistics on poverty in the global village, see Daniel G. Groody, "Globalizing Solidarity: Christian Anthropology and the Challenge of Human Liberation," *Theological Studies* 69 (2008): 250-68.
19. Groody, "Globalizing Solidarity," 258.
20. Meeks, *God the Economist*, 36.
21. Sallie McFague, 'An Ecological Christology: Does Christianity Have It?' in *Christianity and Ecology: Seeking the Well-Being of Earth and Humans*, ed. Dieter T. Hessel and Rosemary Radford Ruether (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2000), 29-45 (30). See also M. Fugue's *Life Abundant: Rethinking Theology and the Economy for a Planet in Peril* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2001), 33-37.
22. Nicolas Berdyaev, *The New Middle Ages*, in vol. 2 of *Collected Works* (Sofia: Zachari Stoyanov, 2003), 515-607 (526, 530-31).
23. Berdyaev, *New Middle Ages*, 531-32; Berdyaev, *Philosophy of Inequality* (Sofia: Prozoretz, 1995), 113-15.
24. Nicolas Berdyaev, *The Meaning of History*, in vol. 2 of *Collected Works* (Sofia: Zachari Stoyanov, 2003), 299-514 (313).
25. Berdyaev, *New Middle Ages*, 531.
26. Berdyaev, *New Middle Ages*, 531.
27. Berdyaev, *New Middle Ages*, 531.
28. Berdyaev, *New Middle Ages*, 522.

29. For more on the concept of *sobornost*, see chapter 1 of the present book.
30. Berdyaev, *Philosophy of Inequality*, 115.
31. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 94.
32. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 133.
33. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 133.
34. We have come to define culture as "what we make of the world." See Andy Crouch, *Culture Making: Recovering Our Creative Calling* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2008), 23. Therefore, many authors view nature as the creation of God and culture as the creation of humanity. See also Kathryn Tanner, *Theories of Culture: A New Agenda for Theology* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1997), 28-29; and H. Richard Niebuhr, *Christ and Culture* (New York: Harper & Row, 1975), 32-34. Niebuhr concludes that "Culture is the 'artificial, secondary environment' which man superimposes on the natural. It comprises language, habits, ideas, beliefs, customs, social organization, inherited artifacts, technical processes, and values" (32). "The world so far as it is man-made and man-intended is the world of culture" (34). It could be argued, however, that if cultivation is the first, rudimentary stage of culture, the gateway to cultural creativity, then (according to the Genesis account) not only nature but also culture could be viewed as created (or, in the case of culture, at least initiated) by God, who not only brings the world into existence but performed the first act of cultivation, represented by the garden of Eden.
35. John Dominic Crossan, *God and Empire: Jesus Against Rome, Then and Now* (New York: HarperOne, 2007), 54.
36. Dimitru Staniloae, *The World: Creation and Deification*, VOL 2 of *The Experience of God: Orthodox Dogmatic Theology* (Brookline, MA: Holy Cross Orthodox Press, 2005), 6.
37. Staniloae, *World*, 2.
38. Staniloae, *World*, 7.
39. Staniloae, *World*, 7.
40. Alexander Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World* (Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1983), 17.
41. Staniloae, *World*, 22.
42. Staniloae, *World*. "The paradox [of the return of the gift] is explained by the fact that the gift received and returned draws the persons close to one another to such an extent that the object of the gift becomes something common and comes to be the transparent means for the fullest communion between persons. And not only is the gift something common, but is also increased through the life which the persons communicate to one another through the love manifested in the gift they make; in this way the persons give themselves as a gift, and through this giving they grow spiritually" (22). "The dialogue of the gift between God and the human person lies in the fact that each bestows himself upon the other" (23).
43. Staniloae, *World*, 22.
44. Staniloae, *World*, 22.
45. For our purposes, "liturgical askesis" is understood as an act of *praktike* (ascetic struggle) within the context of liturgy. As Margaret Pfeil asserts, *praktike* takes place "as the Christian worshiper's graced and free response to God's gratuitous love celebrated in Christian liturgy. First, liturgical

asceticism springs from and seeks to nourish the life of the Christian worshipping community, and second, it implies an eschatological horizon in which the ultimate telos of askesis consists in the fullness of life in God" ("liturgy and Ethics: The Liturgical Asceticism of Energy Conservation," *Journal of the Society of Christian Ethics* 27, no. 2 [Fall/ Winter 2007]: 27-149 [127-221]). As David Fagerberg states, if liturgy means "sharing the life of Christ" and if askesis means discipline (in the sense of forming), then liturgical asceticism is the discipline required to become an icon of Christ and make his image visible in our faces" ("A Century on Liturgical Asceticism", *Diakonia* 31, no. [1998]:41). Liturgical Asceticism involves a contemplative awareness of the practices of the worshipping community as *leitourgia*, the work of the people of God at the service of the world" (Pfeil, "Liturgy and Ethics," 134). Traditionally, however, askesis is not understood only as the means of becoming like God, as a mark of theosis (e.g., in the hagiographies of the saints). Askesis is imitation of God in Christlikeness, by applying the cross to the totality of one's life. Ultimately, it is fasting from oneself for the sake of the other, motivated by self-giving love.

46. Saint Maximus the Confessor, *Gnostic Chapters* 1.67, *Patrologia Graeca* 90:1108].
47. Staniloae, *World*, 25.
48. For an exposition on God as an architect building and furnishing a house, see Crossan, *God and Empire*, 51-52.
49. Crossan, *God and Empire*, 53.
50. Crossan, *God and Empire*, 54.
51. Crossan, *God and Empire*, 54.
52. Walter Brueggemann, *Sabbath as Resistance: Saying No to the Culture of Now* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2014), 6.
53. Brueggemann, *Sabbath as Resistance*, 21.
54. Brueggemann, *Sabbath as Resistance*, 10.
55. Brueggemann, *Sabbath as Resistance*, 36.
56. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 96. Here Patriarch Bartholomew seems to find inspiration in John of Damascus, who states the following in his reflection on humanity and its destiny in theosis: "God then made man without evil, upright, virtuous, free from pain and care, glorified with every virtue, adorned with all that is good, like a sort of second microcosm within the great world, another angel capable of worship, compound, surveying the visible creation and initiated into the mysteries of the realm of thought, king over the things of earth, but subject to a higher king, of the earth and of the heaven, temporal and eternal, belonging to the realm of sight and to the realm of thought, midway between greatness and lowliness, spirit and flesh: for he is spirit by grace, but flesh by overweening pride: spirit that he may abide and glorify his Benefactor, and flesh that he may suffer, and suffering may he admonished and disciplined when he prides himself in his greatness: here, that is, in the present life, his life is ordered as an animal's, but elsewhere, that is, in the age to come, he is changed and—to complete the mystery—becomes deified by merely inclining himself towards God; becoming deified, in the way of participating in the divine glory and not in that of a change into the divine being" (John of Damascus, *An Exposition of the Orthodox Faith*, book 2, chapter 12, "Concerning Man," available at <http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/33042.htm>)
57. Jurgen Moltmann, *The Trinity and the Kingdom* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993), 59.

58. Saint Maximus the Confessor, *Ambigua*, *Patrologia Graeca* 91:1072B -C.
59. Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World*, 15.
60. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 132.
61. Immanuel Kant, *Perpetual Peace: A Philosophical Essay*, trans. M. Campbell (New York: Grand, 1972), 138.
62. Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World*, 15.
63. Alexander Schmemmann, *Of Water and Spirit: A Liturgical Study of Baptism* (Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1974), 95.
64. Schmemmann, *Of Water and Spirit*, 95.
65. Schmemmann, *Of Water and Spirit*, 96.
66. Schmemmann, *Of Water and Spirit*, 97.
67. Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World*, 38. Schmemmann states, "He alone is the perfect Eucharistic Being. He is the Eucharist of the world. In and through this Eucharist the whole creation becomes what it always was to be and yet failed to be."
68. On the prophethood of the Pentecost Community through a Pentecostal perspective, see Roger Stronstad, *The Prophethood of All Believers*, JPTSup 16 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1999), 65-70. See also chapter 2 of the present book.
69. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 96.
70. If we look closely at the function of creation within the economic process, we will notice a different form of economic participation that does not follow market logic. Creation is not compensated for its contribution—therefore it does not participate in the economic exchange, but follows a model of sharing itself (and its resources) with humanity. It follows the model of the self-sharing and hospitality of its Creator.
71. Martin Hengel, *Property and Riches in the Early Church* (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1974), 32.
72. The incarnationalist view of Pentecost for which I have argued in previous works allows us to consider the possibility of looking at the remainder of Acts as rooted in (111110'1 extended presence on earth in his body. Therefore, if the Gospel of Luke represents the first volume of "all that Jesus began to do and teach" (Acts 1:1), the book of Acts can be seen as the second volume, outlining "the continuation and fulfillment of what Jesus did and thought" Matthias Wenk, *Community-Forming Power: The Socio-Ethical Role of the Spirit in Luke Acts*, JPTSup 19 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 2000), 242. The author points to the outpouring of the Spirit at Pentecost as a clear example that the ministry of Christ (the baptizer with Holy Spirit) continues in Acts (243). He mentions also the passages of Acts 9:5,10; 13:39; 7:55, 17:7; 18:10; 19:15; and 25:19 as indicative of Jesus's acting upon the disciples. Another example is the healing of the beggar in Acts 3:1-16, "presented as a continuation of Jesus' healing ministry (Acts 4:30)" (245). Beverly Gaventa's work also supports the view of the book of Acts as presenting a continuation of the ministry of Jesus. See her commentary *The Acts of the Apostles*, Abingdon New Testament Commentaries (Nashville: Abingdon, 2003), 34. 61.
73. Alexander Schmemmann, "The Missionary Imperative in the Orthodox Tradition," in *t a %tern Orthodox Theology: A Contemporary Reader*, ed. Daniel B. Clendenin (Grand Rapids: 1995), 195-210 (201).

74. Luke T. Johnson, *Sharing Possessions: Mandate and Symbol of Faith* (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981), 40.
75. Vladimir Lossky *Orthodox Theology: An introduction* (Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2001), 71; Christoforos Stavropoulos, "Partakers of Divine Nature" in *Eastern Orthodox Theology: A Contemporary Reader*. ed. Daniel B. Clendenin (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1995), 186.
76. Brian K. Blount, "The Apocalypse of Worship: A House of Prayer for All Nations," In *Making Room at the Table: An Invitation to Multicultural Worship*, ed. Brian K. Blount and Leonora Tubbs Tisdale (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2001), 21.
77. Miroslav Volf, *Exclusion and Embrace: A Theological Exploration of identity, Otherness and Reconciliation* (Nashville: Abingdon, 1996), 2x8-29. For an extensive study on the spiritual mandate of sharing possessions, see Johnson, *Sharing Possessions*. The author discusses 1 topic also in relation to the event of Pentecost (21).
78. In her book *Of Widows and of Meals: Communal Meals in the Book of Acts* (Grand Rap. ids: Eerdmans, 2007), Rata Halterman Finger offers an in-depth study of the daily commensality of natural- and fictive-kin groups in first-century Palestine. She examines the passages in Acts concerning the economic life of the early Christians on the background of social economic practices of the day and from the contextual viewpoint of the poor (especially widows and their daughters, who were one of the most economically destitute demographic groups). She emphasizes the communal daily breaking of bread both as sharing between kin in a communal *eating* and a sacramental practice, which originated with the meals Jesus shared with both Jews and gentiles. Some authors have distinguished between the *koinonia* in Acts 2:42 and the breaking of bread as between communal and eucharistic meals. However, it is the presence of Jesus Christ that transforms a meal into a Lord's Supper. Therefore, the sacramental nature of sharing the meal in the name of the Lord, in evocation of his presence in the unity of his body on earth in thanksgiving, is translated in both daily commensality and the Eucharist.
79. Walter Brueggemann, *Journey to the Common Good* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2010), 32.
80. Alexander Schmemmann, *The Eucharist: Sacrament of the Kingdom* (Crestwood, NY: Si Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1987), 33
81. Schmemmann, *Eucharist*, 19.
82. Schmemmann, *Eucharist*, 21.
83. Alexander Schmemmann, "Liturgy and Theology," in *Liturgy and Tradition: Theological Reflections of Alexander Schmemmann*, ed. Thomas Frisch (Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1990), 49-69 (57-58).
84. Schmemmann, *Eucharist*, 34.
85. Pfeil, 'Liturgy and Ethics,' 136.
86. Meeks, *God the Economist*, 45-
87. See Daniela C. Augustine, *Pentecost, Hospitality, and Transfiguration: Toward a Spirit-inspired Vision of Social Transformation* (Cleveland. TNT: CPT, 2012), 56-59.
88. Schmemmann, *Of Water and Spirit*, 118.
89. Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World*, 26.
90. Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World*, 27.

91. George Theokritoff, "The Cosmology of the Eucharist," in *Toward an Ecology of Transfiguration: Orthodox Christian Perspectives on Environment, Nature, and Creation*, ed. JAI Chryssavgis and Bruce V. Foltz (New York: Fordham University Press, 2013), 131-35.
92. Theokritoff, "Cosmology of the Eucharist," 133 -34.
93. Brueggemann, *Journey to the Common Good*, 32.
94. William Cavanaugh, *Being Consumed: Economics and Christian Desire* (Grand Rapids: Erdmans, 2008), 54.
95. Cavanaugh, *Being Consumed*, 55.
96. Schmemmann, "Missionary Imperative," 200.
97. Schmemmann, "Missionary Imperative," 200.
98. This, undoubtedly, is another aspect of the Eastern Orthodox cultural roots of these Pentecostal communities (particularly the preucharistic fast and prayer vigil required by the Typikon). The length of the fast is up to each separate believer and may last from a day in over a week.
99. Alexander Schmemmann, "Fast and Liturgy" *St. Vladimir's Seminary Quarterly* 3, no.1 (Winter 1959): 2 -9. (available at <https://oca.org/reflections/fr-alexander-schmemmann/fast-and-liturgy>)
100. Schmemmann, "Fast and Liturgy."
101. Schmemmann, "Fast and Liturgy"
102. Schmemmann, "Fast and Liturgy"
103. For an expounded reflection on the gospel accounts of Jesus's temptation in the wilderness, see chapter 2 of the present book.
104. Schmemmann, "Fast and Liturgy."
105. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*. 82.
106. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 84.
107. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 82.
108. Bartholomew I, *Encountering the Mystery*, 84.
109. In the Eastern Orthodox liturgical calendar, this is the last Sunday prior to the beginning of the Great Lent.
110. The Eucharist as a sacrament of forgiveness and reconciliation is further discussed in chapter 4 of the present work.
111. Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World*, 31.
112. Schmemmann, *For the Life of the World*, 34.
113. Sallie McFague, "Epilogue: The Human Dignity and the Integrity of Creation," in *Theology That Matters: Ecology, Economy, and God*, ed. Darby Kathleen Ray (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2006), 199-212 (209).
114. Edith Wyschogrod, *Saints and Postmodernity: Revisioning Moral Philosophy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), xxi. For more engagement of Wyschogrod's work, see the epilogue of the present book.

115. McFague, "Epilogue," 209-10.
116. Cavanaugh, *Being Consumed*, 86.
117. McFague, "Epilogue," 209.
118. Cavanaugh, *Being Consumed*, 56.
119. For a study of the Jubilee theme in the Synoptic Gospels and its implication for ethics, see Sharon H. Ringe, *Jesus, Liberation, and the Biblical Jubilee: Images for Ethics and Christology* (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1985).
120. Marcia Y. Riggs, "The Globalization of Nothing and Creation Ex Nihilo," in *Theology Matters: Ecology, Economy, and God*, ed. Darby Kathleen Ray (Minneapolis: Fortress,) 006 . 141-53 (148).
121. Rosa Luxemburg, "Socialism and the Churches," *Marxist Classics*, <http://www.newyouth.com/archives/classics/luxemburg/socialismandthechurches.html>
122. Emmanuel Levinas, *Beyond the Verse: Talmudic Readings and Lectures* (London: Continuum, 2007), 40.
123. James K. A. Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship, Worldview, and Cultural Formation*, vol. 1 of *Cultural Liturgies* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2009), 101.
124. Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom*, 101.
125. This is a paraphrase of Saint Irenaeus's statement, "the glory of God is man fully alive." The text continues: "moreover man's life is the vision of God: if God's revelation through creation has already obtained life for all the beings that dwell on earth, how much more will the Word's manifestation of the Father obtain life for those who see God" (*Adversus Haereses* 4.20.7). The paraphrase captures the spirit of the text and was made famous by Sallie McFague's writings, especially *Life Abundant*, 3.

To purchase the book, *The Spirit and the Common Good*, please visit:

<https://www.amazon.co.uk/Spirit-Common-Good-Shared-Flourishing-ebook/dp/B07Z488BNW>